

APPROVED MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

March 20, 2014, 10:00 a.m.

Halsey Lecture Hall, Virginia Historical Society, 428 N. Boulevard, Richmond, VA

**State Review Board Members Present**

Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chairperson  
Dr. Laurant Lee, Vice-Chair  
Dr. Gabrielle M. Lanier  
Joseph D. Lahendro  
Dr. John Metz

**Historic Resources Board Members Present**

James Rich, Chairperson  
Robert Johnson, Vice-Chair  
William Garner  
Terri Hauser  
H. Edward "Chip" Mann

**Department of Historic Resources Staff Present**

Julie Langan, Director  
Marc Wagner  
Melina Bezirdjian  
Michael Pulice  
Pam Schenian

David Edwards  
Joanie Evans  
Lena Sweeten McDonald  
Jennifer Pullen  
Randy Jones

**Guests present** (from sign-in sheet) – Laura Bartee (The Plains Historic District); Anne Stuart Beckett (Melrose Caverns and Harrison Farmstead); David Brown (Point Lookout Archaeological Site); Brian Carson (Cavalier Hotel); Sandra and Phil Charles (Lackawanna); Richard Gargeglia (The Plinas Historic District); Cindy and Zach Grandle (Plains Mill); Jim Hill (Hermitage Road Warehouse Historic District); Debra McClane (Carters Run Rural Historic District); T. McCreary; Edward Mercer (Stafford Training School); John Pruitt (Tangier Island Historic District); Janet Ramsey (Plains Mill); Mimi Sadler (Hermitage Road Warehouse Historic District); Robin Robertson Starr (Hermitage Road Warehouse Historic District); Bob Steig (Millbank); R. Tashjian (Tangier Island Historic District); Gordon White (Stafford Training School); Tom Yancey (Melrose Caverns and Harrison Farmstead); Carolyn Zemerian (Tangier Island Historic District)

**Historic Resources Board (HRB)**

Chair James Rich called the HRB meeting to order at 10:19 a.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance, and noted that the board members welcome public comment. He explained the role of the HRB and asked each member to introduce themselves. He then presented the December 2013 meeting minutes. With a motion from Vice-Chair Johnson and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB unanimously approved the minutes.

**State Review Board (SRB)**

Chair Elizabeth Moore called the SRB meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. She explained the role of the SRB and the process of designation, and invited each board member to introduce themselves. She then presented the December 2013 meeting minutes. With a motion from Dr. Lanier and a second from Vice-Chair Lee, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the minutes.

**Resolution**

Chair Moore read a resolution acknowledging retiring SRB member John Metz's service to the Commonwealth. Chair Rich thanked Dr. Metz on behalf of the HRB.

**Director's Report (DHR)**

Director Julie Langan introduced Assistant Attorney General Steve Owens and two of his staff members who were in attendance, and presented a report to the boards. Governor McAuliffe has set a goal of preserving 400,000 acres of open and green space. The General Assembly returns to Richmond next week to approve a budget for the next fiscal year. The proposed budget includes funding for a highway marker staff member and some program funds, but removes two vacant positions – director of the western region office and deputy SHPO for strategic planning. Battlefield state grants funding is anticipated to be about \$2 million. Director Langan attended the NSHPO conference in Washington DC. Activities included visiting Virginia's congressional delegation and working to inform legislators about the economic impact of federal historic rehabilitation tax credits. A recently released report documents the economic impact of the state and federal historic rehabilitation tax credits in Virginia. The Virginia Historical Society has begun a major redesign of exhibit spaces. DHR will be designing a new exhibit in a new space on the west side of the building. DHR received a \$1.5 million grant from the National Park Service to address damage incurred by historic properties due to Hurricane Sandy. A part-time grants manager has been hired to administer the program. Fort Albion off Tangier Island has been included in the NPS Network to Freedom. DHR has added to our website material dealing with mid-twentieth century modern resources, the New Dominion Virginia

initiative. A 55-acre tract in Orange County formerly owned by Wal Mart and associated with the Wilderness Battlefield has been donated to DHR. A battlefield symposium takes place April 30-May 1, funded in part through the American Battlefield Protection Program and Virginia Historical Society. DHR is reviewing regulations for the burial permitting process, in response to new state legislation concerning unmarked cemeteries. Staffing changes at DHR include Marc Wagner's transition to director of the Capital Region office, while Lena McDonald has assumed additional responsibilities with the Register program. Caroline Warner is departing to join Historic Richmond Foundation and Jennifer Loux will be joining DHR as the highway marker historian. Second interviews are taking place for the new easement stewardship position. Current vacancies include the deputy SHPO for preservation programs and division manager for the Survey and Register Division. Joanie Evans will be retiring at the end of June 2014. DHR regrets the retirement of John Metz from the SRB; new appointments to the SRB will be forthcoming. All other SRB members have agreed to continue serving. A procedural glitch occurred with an appointment to the HRB in December, and DHR awaits a new appointment to that board from the governor's office. Upcoming marker dedications include one in Petersburg that HRB member Chip Mann will attend on behalf of DHR. The June board meeting is planned to take place in Middleburg.

**Mr. Wagner presented the following nomination for the Capital Region:**

1. \*\*Hermitage Road Warehouse Historic District, City of Richmond, #127-6730, Criteria A and C

**Comments made:**

Chair Moore asked for clarification on the Richmond CAR's comments. Mr. Wagner said the CAR preferred to see the Export Leaf Tobacco warehouse buildings nominated individually instead of as part of a historic district.

Chair Rich invited comments from the public. Robert Holstein, owner of 1400 Overbrook Road, spoke in support of the nomination. Jim Hill, City of Richmond, said the City of Richmond administration does not oppose the NR nomination as presented, but the City's Commission for Architectural Review did not support it.

Chair Rich asked the HRB for questions about the nomination. Ms. Hauser asked how many buildings are within the district and if all had an association with rail transportation. With a motion from Mr. Mann and a second from Vice-Chair Johnson, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nomination as presented.

Chair Moore asked the SRB for comments about the nominations. None were posed. With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Vice-Chair Lee, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nomination as presented.

**Mr. Wagner presented the following nomination for the Capital Region:**

1. Tangier Island Historic District, Town of Tangier, Accomack County, #309-0001, Criteria A, C, and D

**Comments made:**

Chair Rich and Mr. Garner spoke in favor of protecting the island. Mr. Mann and Ms. Hauser asked about using National Register listing to bring attention to the island and about erosion impacts.

Chair Rich invited comments from the public. A Tangier resident spoke in favor of the nomination, and discussed the Swain Memorial United Methodist Church on the island.

With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nomination as presented.

Chair Moore asked the SRB for comments about the nomination. None were posed. With a motion from Dr. Metz and a second from Vice-Chair Lee, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nomination as presented.

Mr. Lahendro thanked DHR staff for their work on the NR nomination.

**Ms. Schenian presented the following nominations for the Tidewater Region:**

1. Cavalier Hotel, City of Virginia Beach, #134-0503, Criteria A and C
2. Point Lookout Archaeological Site, Gloucester County, #036-0064, Criterion D

**Comments made:**

Chair Rich invited comments from the public. None were made.

Chair Rich asked the HRB for questions about the nominations. With a motion from Mr. Garner and a second from Vice-Chair Johnson, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Chair Moore asked the SRB for comments about the nominations. None were made. With a motion from Vice-Chair Lee and a second from Dr. Lanier, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

**Ms. Evans presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:**

1. Carter’s Run Rural Historic District, Fauquier County, #030-5603, Criteria A, B, and C
2. Lackawanna, Town of Front Royal, Warren County, #112-5351, Criterion C
3. Melrose Caverns and Harrison Farmstead, Rockingham County, #082-0117, Criteria A, C and D
4. Millbank, Frederick County, #034-0005, Criteria A and C
5. Plains Mill, Town of Timberville, Rockingham County, #082-5403, Criteria A and C
6. The Plains Historic District, Fauquier County, #311-5001, Criteria A and C

**Comments made:**

Chair Rich asked for comments from the public. Mr. Bob Steig spoke in support of the nomination for Millbank and provided background information on the house’s role in the Third Battle of Winchester. Mr. Steig thanked DHR staff for their support in seeing the property nominated. Richard Guardliano (sp?) from Warrenton, Virginia, owns property in The Plains Historic District and spoke in support of the nomination. Mr. Tom Yancey, owner of Melrose Caverns and Harrison Farmstead, spoke in support of the property’s nomination. Ms. Sandra Charles thanked DHR staff member Joanie Evans for her support in nominating Lackawanna.

Chair Rich asked the HRB for questions about the nominations. None were posed. With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Vice-Chair Johnson, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nomination as presented.

Chair Moore asked the SRB for comments about the nominations. With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Vice-Chair Lee, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

**Mr. Pulice presented the following nomination for the Western Region:**

1. \*\*Mechanicsville Historic District, City of Danville, #108-5607, Criteria A and C
2. \*\*Salem Avenue/Roanoke Automotive Commercial Historic District 2013 Boundary Increase, City of Roanoke, #128-6065, Criteria A and C

**Comments made:**

Chair Moore asked for public comment. None were made.

Chair Rich asked the HRB for questions about the nominations. Ms. Hauser asked about the delineation of the boundary increase. With a motion from Vice-Chair Johnson and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Chair Moore asked the SRB for comments about the nominations. None were posed. With a motion from Vice-Chair Lee and a second from Dr. Metz, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

The joint meeting adjourned at 12:39 p.m.

AFTERNOON SESSION

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Historic Resources Board Members Present

James Rich, Chairperson  
Robert Johnson, Vice-Chair  
William Garner  
Terri Hauser  
H. Edward “Chip” Mann

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Julie Langan, Director  
Elizabeth Tune  
Gillian Bearn  
Megan Melinat  
Joanna Wilson Green  
Caroline Warner

Guests: Jim Campi, Kathy Robertson, and Tom Whitmore (Civil War Trust); W. Denman Zirkle and John Hutchinson (Shenandoah Valley Battlefields Foundation); Stafford Training School and Reston – a “New Town” highway marker sponsors

Chair Rich called the HRB meeting to order at 1:05 p.m.

## **HIGHWAY MARKERS**

Ms. Warner greeted the Historic Resources Board and introduced sponsors from Stafford Training School, Dinwiddie Training School (Southside High School) and Reston – a “New Town.” All had representatives speak on their marker’s behalf. Warner proposed that the board cast a single vote to approve the marker agenda following questions and text edits.

### **Sponsor Markers/Diversity**

#### **Guests (sponsors) in attendance:**

- 1. St. Paul’s Chapel School – Rosenwald Funded (Brunswick County)**
- 2. Orange Graded School – Rosenwald Funded (Orange County)**
- 3. Stafford Training School (Stafford County)**
- 4. Dinwiddie Normal Industrial School (Southside High School) (Dinwiddie County)**
- 5. Amelia Perry Pride’s Dorchester Home (City of Lynchburg)**
- 6. Camp Davis (City of Lynchburg)**
- 7. Bay Shore Hotel (City of Hampton)**

#### **Comments Made:**

##### Camp Davis

The board recommended one small edit to the text.

Chair Rich called for a motion to approve the markers as amended. With a motion by Mr. Garner and a second by Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the markers as amended.

## **EASEMENTS**

Jim Campi, Tom Gilmore and Kathy Robertson, all representatives of the Civil War Trust (CWT), presented an overview of their organization’s strategies for battlefield preservation, including conservation easements and the acquisition process. They discussed CWT’s long standing preservation partnership with DHR and their current focus on sesquicentennial battles (1864), as well as the organization’s mission and selection criteria.

### **CWT Easements for Consideration**

Ms. Tune presented the following easements to the HRB for consideration:

- 1. Mack Tract, Brandy Station Battlefield, Culpeper County**  
**Property Owner:** Civil War Preservation Trust  
**Acres:** 5.886  
**Grant Funding (tentative):** Federal Transportation Enhancement
- 2. Jenks Tract, Glendale Battlefield, Henrico County**  
**Property Owner:** Mathew Jenks, under contract to Civil War Preservation Trust  
**Acres:** 1.0  
**Grant Funding (tentative):** American Battlefield Protection Program
- 3. Howard Tract, Appomattox Courthouse Battlefield, Appomattox County**  
**Property Owner:** Harold and Cynthia Howard, under contract to Civil War Preservation Trust  
**Acres:** 2.63  
**Grant Funding (tentative):** American Battlefield Protection Program, Virginia Civil War Sites Preservation Fund

Staff recommended approval of the Mack Tract as presented; approval of the Jenks Tract with the condition that the buildings and structures are removed within three (3) years; and approval of the Howard Tract with the condition that the structures are removed three to five years after the life estate expires.

Chair Rich inquired if there were legal issues with the life estate. Ms. Bearns clarified that there were not, as the life estate is reserved subject to the conservation easement. Chair Rich asked who handles enforcement. Ms. Bearns answered that DHR would as easement holder, and that CWT and the life estate holder would bear joint responsibility for the property. Ms. Bearns also relayed DHR staff’s preference to develop a relationship with the life estate holders during the negotiation process, so that the life estate holders fully understand DHR’s stewardship role following recordation.

Vice-Chair Johnson moved to accept the offer; the motion was seconded by Ms. Hauser and the HRB voted unanimously to approve these three offers as presented.

## Easements for Reconsideration

Ms. Tune and Ms. Bearn presented the following item:

### **1. Island Farm, Cedar Creek Battlefield, Shenandoah County**

**Property Owner:** Madison Development Associates, LLC and Sunlight Properties, LLC

**Acres:** approx. 168.5

**Co-Held:** Shenandoah Valley Battlefields Foundation

**Grant Funding:** Farm and Ranchland Protection Program, Virginia Land Conservation Foundation, Virginia Civil War Sites Preservation Fund

Staff reviewed the offer initially reviewed and approved by the HRB at its September 22, 2011, meeting and listed the changes to those terms as a result of the negotiation process. Staff further identified challenges specific to this easement offer and negotiation, including recorded utility easements across the property, homeowner's association (HOA) restrictive covenants, and a possible municipal landfill. Chair Rich questioned the decision by staff at the American Battlefield Protection Program to extend the Civil War Sites Advisory Commission boundaries of the Cedar Creek Battlefield to include the subject property. Staff confirmed that the decision was made administratively by the American Battlefield Protection Program and communicated in an email, but has not yet been included in a public report. Chair Rich asked if the changes to the easement conditions presented reflected DHR's recommendations. Ms. Tune responded that they represented the current state of the negotiations now included in the draft deed. Ms. Bearn presented the other challenges of the easement negotiation, and John Hutchinson of SVBF clarified that the parcel containing the possible landfill as well as visible ground water monitors has been removed from the offer.

Mr. Garner asked if there was a staff recommendation on the request for reconsideration. Ms. Bearn replied that staff was not making a recommendation, and that while some of the requested documentation had been submitted very recently, a number of outstanding issues remain to be resolved. Ms. Bearn stated that, should the HRB want to accept the amended offer, she could provide a draft of the conditions staff would recommend from a technical perspective. Mr. Hutchinson of the Shenandoah Valley Battlefields Foundation (SVBF) explained that the property is heavily mortgaged and that the contract will not be extended beyond the end of the month if the HRB declines to accept the current offer at this meeting. Ms. Hauser stated that she was not convinced this property represents the highest and best use of staff resources and time.

W. Denman Zirkle, CEO of the SVBF, addressed the HRB, and informed them of his understanding that a commercial buyer is interested in the property. He restated his belief that the property retains immense conservation value and encouraged the HRB to approve the offer with hard conditions.

Mr. Mann made a motion to defer making a decision on this issue until the next meeting; the motion was seconded by Mr. Garner. The motion passed unanimously after the following discussion:

Vice-Chair Johnson reminded the HRB that they have a previously approved offer. Mr. Mann clarified that he was not prepared to make a decision at this meeting. He felt the offer has merits but was unwilling to accept or reject the offer at this time. Ms. Hauser clarified that if the HRB deferred the amended proposal, the original approval would remain. Mr. Mann agreed that the HRB was willing to provide additional time for the negotiations, but was not willing to accept the offer as presented.

## Additional Easements for Consideration

Ms. Bearn presented the following easements to the HRB for consideration:

### **1. Pleasant Point, Surry County (Easement Amendment)**

**Property Owner:** Moore Brothers Company, Inc.

**Acres:** 9.03 additional acres

### **2. Currie House, Town of Blacksburg, Montgomery County**

**Property Owner:** W. Peter Trower and Marcella J. Griggs

**Acres:** 0.50

Staff recommended approval of these two offers as presented. With a motion from Vice-Chair Johnson to accept these offers and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve these two offers.

## Revision of Regulations Concerning Burial Permits

Joanna Wilson Green, DHR Easement Program Archaeologist, provided updated information concerning burial permits and proposed revisions to VA Administrative Code 17VAC5-20 et seq. Delegate Anderson sponsored an amendment to existing burial legislation that essentially updates the notification process. DHR has published a Notice of Regulatory Amendment initiating the public process of amending the regulations promulgating our section of the code (§10.1-2305). Chair Rich asked if any statutory revisions were proposed.

Wilson Green confirmed that the revisions were entirely regulatory in nature and that draft revisions would be provided to the VBHR for review at its June meeting.

**Easements Recorded Since the September 2013 HRB Meeting:**

The review of these was postponed to the June 19, 2014 meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:07 p.m.

**STATE REVIEW BOARD**

Chair Moore called the meeting to order at 1:17 p.m. in the Collections Study Room at the Department of Historic Resources for discussion and consideration of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

**State Review Board Members Present**

- Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chair
- Dr. Luranett Lee, Vice-Chair
- Joseph D. Lahendro
- Dr. Gabriel Lanier
- Dr. John Metz

**Department of Historic Resources Staff Present**

- David Edwards
- Joanie Evans
- Lena McDonald
- Michael Pulice
- Pam Schenian
- Marc Wagner
- Melina Bezirdjian

**Guests (from sign-in sheet):** Jane Covington (Ashburn Historic District); Tami Furr (Clowser House); Leigh Jameson (Drover’s Rest); Elaine Miller (Clowser House); Clare Mullett (Clowser House); Pat Mullett (Clowser House); Gray O’Dwyer (Drover’s Rest); Carolyn Zemerian

**Preliminary Information Applications**

**The following proposals were *endorsed*, unless otherwise noted, with the following comments:**

**Preliminary Information Applications**

**Tidewater Region.....presented by Pam Schenian**  
No PIFs to present

**Western Region.....presented by Michael Pulice**

1. Chatham Southern Railway Depot, Pittsylvania County, #187-0009, Criterion C  
SRB endorsed the PIF.

2. Huddle Farm, Wythe County, #098-5474, Criterion C  
SRB endorsed the PIF.

**Northern Region.....presented by Joanie Evans**

1. \*\*Ashburn Historic District, Loudoun County, 053-0013, Criteria A and C  
Mr. Lahendro asked if the rail line through the town is still extant. Ms. Covington said it is now a walking and biking trail. Mr. Lahendro asked how the currently proposed district compared to the 2002 proposal. Maps of the 2002 proposal were circulated among SRB members. Ms. Covington said one building within the core of the proposed district has been demolished since 2002, and some infill development has occurred since then albeit in compatible size and design. Ms. Covington indicated that public outreach has begun and thus far response from property owners has been positive. Ms. McDonald recommended that historic maps, photos, and aerial images be consulted to demonstrate continuity of integrity in the built environment.

2. \*\*Centreville Confederate Military Railroad Site, #029-5012, Criterion A  
Information about the enslaved workforce who built the railroad should be included in the nomination. Vice-Chair Lee suggested consulting records of slave owners for information on hiring out of slaves. Confederate military records also may have information. SRB

members agreed the documentation presented in the nomination must be thorough to demonstrate the military significance of the railroad, and should include the social history concerning the use of enslaved workers.

3. Clowser House/Council House, Frederick County, #034-1531, Criteria A and C

SRB endorsed the PIF. Mr. Lahendro offered to provide contact information for a structural engineer with experience in historic buildings to evaluate potential water damage to the dwelling.

4. Drover’s Rest, Fairfax County, #029-0012, Criteria A and C

A representative for the property owner said archaeological fragments are commonly found throughout the property. Chair Moore suggested the Fairfax County chapter of ASV might like to visit the property. If testing is done, Criterion D might be included in a National Register nomination. Dr. Metz asked how many log buildings remain in Fairfax County. Ms. Evans said fewer than five likely remain. Mr. Lahendro asked about architect Charles Whitaker’s career. The owner representative said he was the *AIA Journal* editor during the 1930s. Mr. Lahendro said the gauged and undercut flooring is indicative of an early building technique.

5. Gramercy Farm, Bath County, #008-0041, Criterion C

Dr. Metz asked if the Duncan Lee plans are extant. The property owner said some are at VHS and some in the family’s holdings, along with the specifications book. The family also has the Gillette plans and his original plant list. The Frazier firm in Staunton has prepared current measured drawings of the dwellings. Dr. Lanier asked where the stone in the newer section came from. The property owner said it is a variety of fieldstone but it is not certain where it was sourced. Dr. Metz suggested looking at *Country Life* magazine issues published during the early twentieth century to see if Gramercy Farm was featured. Mr. Lahendro said the ownership history of the property should be investigated – was the property confiscated by the Confederate army? To whom did ownership transfer after the Civil War?

6. \*\*Rochester Ropes, Town of Culpeper, Culpeper County, #204-5054, Criteria A and C

SRB endorsed the PIF.

7. Silas Burke House, Fairfax County, #029-0171, Criterion C

The dwelling is recognized as one of a few survivors from the historic period in its area of Fairfax County. The SRB noted that the retention of 5 acres of open space around the house is a key aspect of its setting, feeling, and association.

8. Stokesville Train Depot, Augusta County, #007-0240, Criteria A and C

Chair Moore suggested focusing the historic boundary on resources associated with the depot, rather than using just the current parcel boundaries. Dr. Lanier said the series of disasters that affected commerce (the chestnut blight, tannery fire, and 1949 flood) should be included in the statement of significance.

**Northern Region.....presented by Lena McDonald**

1. Camp Alkulana, Bath County, #008-5049, Criteria A and C

Mr. Lahendro said the nomination should describe the camp’s development over time and its evolution through the different periods of development (1910s, 1930s, 1950s through early 1960s). If an architect or a landscape architect has been identified, that should be included. Nominations for similar summer camps should be checked to evaluate Camp Alkulana against other listed properties.

2. Camp Mont Shenandoah, Bath County, #008-5048, Criteria A and C

Mr. Lahendro said the nomination should describe the camp’s development over time and its evolution through the different periods of development. Why was Bath County chosen as the site for the camp? Explain Nannie West’s association with the area (the PIF notes she vacationed there).

**Capital Region.....presented by Lena McDonald**

1. J. E. B. Stuart Monument, Henrico County, #043-0198

The SRB requested additional documentation on the monument’s design and history, exactly how it was associated with the Lost Cause Movement, and why this makes the property significant and how it meets Criteria Consideration F (Commemorative Properties). The SRB did not find the property eligible for the registers based on the information provided in the PIF, and recommended that nomination not be prepared unless the requested documentation can be provided. The SRB advised the property owner to check with VDOT to see if a proposed statewide survey of Civil War monuments within VDOT right-of-way was completed. Ms. Schenian said that a similar PIF for a Civil War monument in Princess Anne Court House was deferred by DHR’s evaluation team due to lack of sufficient context information on this resource type in Virginia.

Chair Moore adjourned the SRB meeting at 4:25 p.m.